

## Table of Contents

SUMMARY .....	I
Need for Action.....	i
Purpose and Objectives .....	ii
Alternatives .....	ii
Alternative A: No Action .....	ii
Alternative B: Control Non-Native Deer at Pre-Determined Levels by Agency Removal .....	iii
Alternative C: Control Non-Native Deer at Pre-Determined Levels by Agency Removal and Fertility Control .....	iii
Alternative D: Removal of All Non-Native Deer by Agency Personnel.....	iv
Alternative E (Preferred Alternative): Removal of All Non-Native Deer by a Combination of Agency Removal and Fertility Control .....	iv
Impacts .....	v
Water Quality and Water Resources .....	v
Soils .....	v
Vegetation.....	vi
Wildlife.....	vi
Species and Habitats of Management Concern .....	vii
Northern Spotted Owl.....	vii
Western Snowy Plover.....	vii
California Red-legged Frog .....	viii
Coho Salmon, Steelhead Trout, and Chinook Salmon.....	viii
California Freshwater Shrimp.....	viii
Myrtle’s Silverspot Butterfly .....	viii
Bird Species of Concern).....	ix
Plant Species of Special Concern .....	ix
Human Health and Safety.....	ix
Visitor Experience .....	ix
Park Operations .....	x
Regional Economy .....	x
CHAPTER 1: PURPOSE AND NEED.....	1
Introduction .....	1
Need .....	1
Purpose and Objectives .....	2
Background .....	3
Management of Axis and Fallow Deer.....	3
NPS Mandates and Policies / Park Purpose and Significance .....	4
PRNS/ GGNRA Enabling Legislation .....	5
Relationship to Other Park Plans.....	6
Relationship to Other Federal Laws .....	7
Relationship to State Laws and Other Agencies, Laws, Policies and Plans.....	9
Scoping Process and Public Participation .....	9
Issues and Impact Topics .....	10
Water Resources and Water Quality .....	10
Soils .....	11
Vegetation.....	11
Wildlife.....	11
Species and Habitats of Management Concern .....	11

Human Health and Safety.....	11
Visitor Experience.....	11
Park Operations.....	12
Regional Economy.....	12
Issues Considered and Rejected.....	12
Management of Native Deer at PRNS.....	12
Management of Non-Native Deer Outside of NPS Boundaries.....	12
Livestock Management at PRNS.....	12
Required Impact Topics.....	13
Conflicts Between the Alternatives and any State or Local Land Use Plans or Policies ...	13
Wetlands and Floodplains.....	13
Prime and Unique Agricultural Lands.....	13
Important Scientific or Cultural Resources.....	13
CHAPTER 2: ALTERNATIVES.....	15
Introduction.....	15
The Process for Formulating Alternatives.....	15
Actions Common to All Alternatives.....	16
Alternative A: No Action.....	17
Alternative B: Control Non-Native Deer at Pre-Determined Levels by Agency Removal....	18
Alternative C: Control Non-Native Deer at Pre-Determined Levels by Agency Removal and Fertility Control.....	21
Required Characteristics of Fertility Control Agent.....	22
Contraceptives with Short (1 year or less) Duration.....	23
Sterilants and Long-Acting Contraceptives.....	25
Modeling Results Using Lethal Controls and Contraception.....	26
Axis Deer.....	26
Fallow Deer.....	26
Alternative D: Removal of All Non-Native Deer by Agency Personnel.....	27
Alternative E (Preferred Alternative): Removal of All Non-Native Deer by a Combination of Agency Removal and Fertility Control.....	29
Contraceptives with Short (1 year or less) Duration.....	30
Sterilants and Long-Acting Contraceptives.....	31
Modeling Results Using Lethal Controls and Contraception.....	32
Fallow Deer.....	32
Axis Deer.....	33
Alternatives and Actions Considered but Rejected.....	34
Public Hunting to Control or to Eliminate all Non-Native Deer.....	34
Control or Extirpation Using Only Contraceptives.....	35
Control by Yearly Contraception.....	35
Extirpation by Yearly Contraception.....	37
Control with Long-Acting Contraceptives (“Sterilants”).....	38
Extirpation Using Long-Acting Contraceptive Administration (“Sterilants”).....	39
Surgical Sterilization.....	40
Relocation.....	41
Restricting Deer to a Fenced Area.....	41
Trapping and Euthanasia by Lethal Injection.....	42
Alternative Summary Matrices.....	43
Environmentally Preferable Alternative.....	44
Section 101 of NEPA.....	44
Park’s Preferred Alternative.....	45

CHAPTER 3. AFFECTED ENVIRONMENT .....	59
Introduction .....	59
Project Site Description .....	59
Regional Context and Surrounding Communities .....	59
Park Management Zoning .....	61
Natural Resource Zones .....	61
Wilderness .....	61
Other Significant Area Designations .....	62
Climate .....	63
Air Resources .....	63
Geology and Topography .....	64
Resources that May be Affected .....	65
Water Resources and Water Quality .....	65
Impoundments, Natural Lakes, and Sag Ponds .....	67
Soils .....	67
Vegetation .....	68
Forest/Woodland Types .....	69
Scrub Types .....	70
Herbaceous Types .....	71
Wildlife .....	72
Ungulate Biology .....	73
History of Research on Non-Native Fallow and Axis Deer at Point Reyes National Seashore and Golden Gate National Recreation Area .....	84
Population Studies .....	84
Disease Studies .....	86
Ecological Studies .....	87
Species and Habitats of Management Concern .....	92
Species of Management Concern .....	92
Northern Spotted Owl .....	93
Western Snowy Plover .....	93
California Red-legged Frog .....	93
Coho Salmon, Steelhead Trout and Chinook Salmon .....	94
California Freshwater Shrimp .....	96
Myrtle's Silverspot Butterfly .....	97
Habitats of Management Concern .....	97
Human Health and Safety .....	98
Visitor Experience .....	98
Social Values .....	100
Wilderness .....	101
The Wilderness Act .....	101
Wilderness Character .....	102
Wilderness Values .....	102
Park Operations .....	103
Regional Economy (Socioeconomics) .....	104
Commercial Operations within the Pastoral (Agricultural) Zone .....	104
CHAPTER 4: ENVIRONMENTAL CONSEQUENCES .....	107
Introduction .....	107
Impact Topics and Their Derivation .....	107
Definition of Terms .....	107

Regulations, Policies and Methodology .....	109
Water Resources and Water Quality .....	109
Policies and Regulations.....	109
Assessment Methodology.....	109
Type of Impact.....	110
Duration of Impact.....	110
Intensity of Impact.....	110
Soils.....	110
Policies and Regulations.....	110
Assessment Methodology.....	111
Type of Impact.....	111
Duration of Impact.....	111
Intensity of Impact.....	111
Vegetation .....	112
Policies and Regulations.....	112
Assessment Methodology.....	112
Type of Impact.....	113
Duration of Impact.....	113
Intensity of Impact.....	113
Wildlife .....	113
Policies and Regulations.....	114
Assessment Methodology.....	114
Type of Impact.....	114
Duration of Impact.....	115
Intensity of Impact.....	115
Species and Habitats of Management Concern.....	115
Policies and Regulations.....	115
Assessment Methodology.....	117
Type of Impact.....	117
Duration of Impact.....	118
Intensity of Impact.....	118
Human Health and Safety .....	118
Policies and Regulations.....	118
Assessment Methodology.....	119
Type of Impact.....	120
Duration of Impact.....	120
Intensity of Impact.....	120
Visitor Experience.....	120
Policies and Regulations.....	120
Assessment Methodology.....	122
Type of Impact.....	122
Duration of Impact.....	122
Intensity of Impact.....	122
Park Operations.....	123
Policies and Regulations.....	123
Assessment Methodology.....	123
Type of Impact.....	124
Duration of Impact.....	124
Intensity of Impact.....	124
Regional Economy .....	124
Policies and Regulations.....	125

Assessment Methodology.....	125
Type of Impact.....	125
Duration of Impact.....	126
Intensity of Impact.....	126
Environmental Consequences of Alternative A – No Action.....	126
Impacts on Water Resources and Water Quality.....	126
Analysis.....	126
Cumulative Impacts.....	129
Conclusion.....	132
Impacts on Soils.....	133
Analysis.....	133
Cumulative Impacts.....	135
Conclusion.....	136
Impacts on Vegetation.....	137
Analysis.....	138
Cumulative Impacts.....	142
Conclusion.....	144
Impacts on Wildlife.....	144
Analysis.....	145
Cumulative Impacts.....	154
Conclusion.....	156
Impacts on Species and Habitats of Management Concern.....	157
Analysis.....	157
Special Status Species.....	157
Bird Species of Concern.....	160
Plant Species of Special Concern.....	160
Cumulative Impacts.....	162
Special Status Species.....	162
Unlisted Species of Concern.....	166
Conclusion.....	166
Impacts on Human Health and Safety.....	167
Analysis.....	167
Cumulative Impacts.....	167
Conclusion.....	169
Impacts on Visitor Experience.....	169
Analysis.....	169
Cumulative Impacts.....	171
Conclusion.....	171
Impacts on Park Operations.....	172
Analysis.....	172
Cumulative Impacts.....	174
Conclusion.....	175
Impacts on the Regional Economy.....	175
Analysis.....	175
Cumulative Impacts.....	176
Conclusion.....	177
Environmental Consequences of Alternative B – Control of Non-Native Deer at Pre-Determined Levels by Agency Removal.....	178
Impacts on Water Resources and Water Quality.....	178
Analysis.....	178
Cumulative Impacts.....	179

Conclusion .....	179
Impacts on Soils .....	180
Analysis .....	180
Cumulative Impacts .....	181
Conclusion .....	181
Impacts on Vegetation.....	181
Analysis .....	181
Cumulative Impacts .....	182
Conclusion .....	183
Impacts on Wildlife.....	183
Analysis .....	183
Cumulative Impacts .....	191
Conclusion .....	191
Impacts on Species and Habitats of Management Concern.....	191
Analysis .....	192
Special Status Species.....	192
Cumulative Impacts .....	197
Conclusion .....	197
Impacts on Human Health and Safety .....	197
Analysis .....	197
Cumulative Impacts .....	197
Conclusion .....	198
Impacts on Visitor Experience .....	198
Analysis .....	198
Cumulative Impacts .....	200
Conclusion .....	200
Impacts on Park Operations.....	200
Analysis .....	200
Cumulative Impacts .....	202
Conclusion .....	202
Impacts on Regional Economy.....	202
Analysis .....	202
Cumulative Impacts .....	203
Conclusion .....	203
Environmental Consequences of Alternative C – Control of Non-Native Deer at Pre-Determined Levels by Agency Removal and Fertility Control.....	205
Impacts on Water Resources and Water Quality.....	205
Analysis and Cumulative Impacts.....	205
Impacts on Soils .....	205
Analysis and Cumulative Impacts.....	205
Impacts on Vegetation.....	206
Analysis and Cumulative Impacts.....	206
Impacts on Wildlife .....	206
Analysis and Cumulative Impacts.....	206
Impacts on Species and Habitats of Management Concern.....	206
Analysis and Cumulative Impacts.....	206
Impacts on Human Health and Safety .....	207
Analysis .....	207
Cumulative Impacts .....	207
Conclusion .....	207
Impacts on Visitor Experience .....	208

Analysis .....	208
Cumulative Impacts .....	208
Conclusion .....	209
Impacts on Park Operations.....	209
Analysis .....	209
Cumulative Impacts .....	210
Conclusion .....	210
Impacts on Regional Economy.....	211
Analysis and Cumulative Impacts.....	211
Environmental Consequences of Alternative D: Removal of All Non-Native Deer by Agency Personnel.....	212
Impacts on Water Resources and Water Quality .....	212
Analysis .....	212
Cumulative Impacts .....	213
Conclusion .....	213
Impacts on Soils .....	213
Analysis .....	213
Cumulative Impacts .....	214
Conclusion .....	214
Impacts on Vegetation.....	215
Analysis .....	215
Cumulative Impacts .....	216
Conclusion .....	216
Impacts on Wildlife.....	216
Analysis .....	216
Cumulative Impacts .....	223
Conclusion .....	223
Impacts on Species and Habitats of Management Concern.....	224
Analysis .....	224
Special Status Species.....	224
Cumulative Impacts .....	228
Conclusion .....	229
Impacts on Human Health and Safety .....	229
Analysis .....	229
Cumulative Impacts .....	229
Conclusion .....	230
Impacts on Visitor Experience .....	230
Analysis .....	230
Cumulative Impacts .....	231
Conclusion .....	231
Impacts on Park Operations.....	232
Analysis .....	232
Cumulative Impacts .....	232
Conclusion .....	233
Impacts on the Regional Economy.....	233
Analysis .....	233
Cumulative Impacts .....	234
Conclusion .....	234
Environmental Consequences of Alternative E (Preferred Alternative): Removal of all Non-Native Deer by a Combination of Agency Removal and Fertility Control.....	235
Impacts on Water Resources and Water Quality .....	235

Analysis and Cumulative Impacts.....	235
Impacts on Soils .....	235
Analysis and Cumulative Impacts.....	235
Impacts on Vegetation .....	236
Analysis and Cumulative Impacts.....	236
Impacts on Wildlife .....	236
Analysis and Cumulative Impacts.....	236
Impacts on Species and Habitats of Management Concern.....	237
Analysis and Cumulative Impacts.....	237
Impacts on Human Health and Safety .....	237
Analysis .....	237
Cumulative Impacts .....	237
Conclusion .....	238
Impacts on Visitor Experience .....	238
Analysis .....	238
Cumulative Impacts .....	239
Conclusion .....	239
Impacts on Park Operations.....	239
Analysis .....	239
Cumulative Impacts .....	240
Conclusion .....	240
Impacts on Regional Economy .....	241
Analysis and Cumulative Impacts.....	241
Unavoidable Adverse Impacts .....	241
Agency Scoping .....	246
Public Review of the Draft EIS.....	246
Compliance Status.....	247
List of Preparers .....	249
List of Agencies & Organizations to Whom Notices of the EIS are Being Sent .....	250
Responses to Comments .....	253
Introduction.....	253
Commenter and Correspondence Indices.....	253
Agency and Sample Comments .....	254
NPS Response to Comments.....	302
APPENDIX A: WILDERNESS MINIMUM REQUIREMENT GUIDE .....	335
APPENDIX B: NON-NATIVE DEER POPULATION MODEL (BARRETT) .....	345
APPENDIX C: MONITORING AND MANAGEMENT PLAN FOR ACTION ALTERNATIVES B, C, D AND E.....	355
IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PREFERRED ACTION ALTERNATIVE (E).....	355
MEASURING SUCCESS.....	356
MODIFICATION OF PLAN ACTIONS.....	357
APPENDIX D: FINAL REPORT POINT REYES FALLOW DEER MODELING.....	361
APPENDIX E: SECTION 7 CONSULTATION, US FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE AND NATIONAL OCEANIC AND ATMOSPHERIC ADMINISTRATION .....	382
APPENDIX F: PROJECTS CONSIDERED IN CUMULATIVE IMPACTS ANALYSES .....	386

APPENDIX G: SUMMARY, PUBLIC INFORMATIONAL WORKSHOP, NON-NATIVE DEER MANAGEMENT PLAN, MARCH 3, 2005, 6:30 TO 8:30 P.M.....	406
REFERENCES.....	410
NPS/ PRNS Unpublished Data Sources.....	425
ACRONYMS AND GLOSSARY.....	426

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Estimated Cumulative Total Deer Removals for Alternatives A–E (based on population models by Barrett 2000 and Hobbs 2003).....	43
Figure 2: Map of the Project Area.....	60
Figure 3: Map of the Watersheds Located within the Project Area. ....	66
Figure 4: Tule Elk ( <i>Cervus elaphus nannodes</i> ).....	74
Figure 5: Tule Elk Range (2003).....	75
Figure 6: Columbian Black-tailed Deer ( <i>Odocoileus hemionus columbianus</i> ).....	77
Figure 7: Columbian Black-tailed Deer Range (within NPS boundaries).....	78
Figure 8: Axis Deer ( <i>Axis axis</i> ).....	79
Figure 9: Axis Deer Range (2003).....	80
Figure 10: Fallow Deer ( <i>Dama dama</i> ).....	82
Figure 11: Fallow Deer Range (2003).....	83
Figure 12: Map of Fallow Deer Lek Sites, Bear Valley area, Point Reyes National Seashore (Each point represents one lek, comprised of up to 30 excavated pits and averaging 115 square meters).....	89
Figure 13: Bark Damage (Girdling) of Sapling Douglas Fir in a Lek.....	90
Figure 14: Excavated Pit within a Lek.....	91
Figure 15: Fallow Buck on Small Lek.....	91
Figure 16: Disturbed Soil and Denuded Vegetation at Lek Site, Oak Woodland-Pasture Interface.....	92
Figure 17: Comparison of Costs, Alternatives A-E.....	173
Figure 1 (Appendix C): An Illustration of the Adaptive Management Approach for the Action Alternatives.....	359

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Estimated Cumulative Total Deer Removals for Alternatives A–E (based on population models by Barrett 2000 and Hobbs 2003).....	34
Table 2: Summary of Alternatives .....	46
Table 3. Summary of Impacts of Each Alternative .....	49
Table 4: Summary of Exotic Deer Population Estimates from Introduction to 2003.....	86
Table 5: Perceptions of Animals in American Society.....	100
Table 6: Current Economic Costs of Non-native Deer to Seashore Ranchers .....	106
Table 7: Vegetation Communities Utilized by Fallow Deer at Point Reyes National Seashore (data based on PRNS vegetation map data and current PRNS fallow deer range data).....	137
Table 8. Vegetation Communities Utilized by Axis Deer at Point Reyes National Seashore (data based on PRNS vegetation map data and current PRNS fallow deer range data).....	138
Table 9: Bird Species Likely to be Adversely Impacted by Alternative A. ....	153
Table 10: Bird Species Likely to be Adversely Impacted by Alternative B. ....	189
Table 11: Bird Species Likely to Benefit from Alternative D.....	222